

The research register for this journal is available at
<http://www.emeraldinsight.com/researchregisters>



The current issue and full text archive of this journal is available at
<http://www.emeraldinsight.com/0268-3946.htm>

Linking emotional intelligence, spirituality and workplace performance

Definitions,
models and ideas
for research

Definitions, models and ideas for research

203

Len Tischler, Jerry Biberman and Robert McKeage
*Kantia School of Mangement, University of Scranton, Scranton,
Philadelphia, USA*

Keywords *Performance, Interpersonal communications, Theory, Modelling, Research, Ethics*

Abstract *Despite a reluctance on the part of organizational researchers to deal with the subjects of emotions or spirituality, recent researchers have begun to argue for the importance of exploring their relationship to workplace performance. Recent research, for example, has shown a positive relationship between emotional intelligence and workplace success. Similarly, it appears that spirituality is related to workplace performance or effectiveness. This paper explores the impacts of emotional intelligence and spirituality on workplace effectiveness, presents several theoretical models examining possible linkages among these variables, and, finally, presents several ideas for future research deriving from the models.*

Introduction

Emotions and spirituality are often seen as "black boxes": subjects we cannot know well, so we exclude them or talk around them in our theories and models. Neither term has a clear, universal definition. We (sometimes) know when we are having (feeling) emotions and when we are having (being aware of) spiritual experiences, but we often have difficulty putting these experiences into words that convey precise meaning to others. Except for a few major emotions (e.g. anger, love, envy, anxiety, depression) and spiritual experiences (e.g. feeling connected to the universe, the Transcendent, or God, seeing light, hearing inner or other voices), our emotional and spiritual experiences are often difficult to discern and define even for ourselves when we are having them. Nonetheless, it seems increasingly clear from the emotional intelligence (EI) literature that those with higher EI seem to have healthier, happier, more productive lives and seem to do better at work. It also seems clear from the spirituality literature that people with higher levels of spirituality have healthier, happier, and more productive lives at work. It also seems possible from the literature that people can grow from less to more EI and spirituality over time. This paper presents brief reviews of the EI and spirituality literature mainly as they relate to individuals at work, analyzes similarities and differences across the literature, attempts to model how EI and spirituality might lead to greater workplace success, and suggests future areas for research.



Journal of Managerial Psychology,
Vol. 17 No. 3, 2002, pp. 203-218.
© MCB UP Limited, 0268-3946
DOI 10.1108/02683940210423114

Review of EI findings

The review of EI findings will be divided into two subsections. The first will demonstrate that EI has an impact on work success. The second tries to model the impact.

EI has an impact on work success

EI has its roots in studies of "social intelligence" in the 1920s and perhaps earlier (Laird, 1925; Moss *et al.*, 1927). It was "discovered" again by Salovey and Mayer (1990) who first called it "emotional intelligence", and represents two of the seven ("multiple") intelligences theorized by Gardner (1993): interpersonal and intrapersonal intelligences. Goleman popularized the concept in his 1996 book, as well as the notion that EI might "matter more" than IQ (which represents one of Gardner's seven intelligences).

Currently, there are several definitions of EI in use, and they don't necessarily match well. EI is a multifaceted construct and we don't have a clear, simple definition of it. Because of this, it has been difficult to develop a good paper-and-pencil test to measure EI. Nonetheless, following are two of the more widely used definitions at present. Goleman (1998, p. 317) defines EI as "the capacity for recognizing our own feelings and those of others, for motivating ourselves, and for managing emotions well in ourselves and in our relationships." Martinez (1997, p. 72) "refers to emotional intelligence as being: ... an array of non-cognitive skills, capabilities and competencies that influence a person's ability to cope with environmental demands and pressures" (cited in Dulewicz and Higgs, 2000, p. 342).

A very recent and excellent review of the EI literature (Dulewicz and Higgs, 2000) demonstrates clearly that EI impacts on work success. Work success was defined in this review as advancement in one's work organization. The authors not only did an extensive review of the literature, but did their own research using 100 managers in several organizations over seven years.

According to Dulewicz and Higgs (2000), the preponderance of theory and evidence supports the view that emotional intelligence is aligned with the concept of competencies. It has not only been difficult for paper-and-pencil tests to measure EI, but these tests also do not yield the kind of results expected when trying to measure EI against any predicted effects of EI. A competency framework appears to hold more empirical promise. A competency framework holds that one who has higher emotional intelligence has certain competencies that another person might not have, and direct measures of these competencies against predicted end results would yield better results than comparing paper-and-pencil tests (of these same competencies) against the same predicted end results. In a work setting, the competencies would be job or job-related competencies. Regardless of the means of measuring EI, until now most of the empirical evidence for a relationship between EI and success at work has been anecdotal, with only a few good studies. Those that have used measured competencies, however, appear to demonstrate a relationship between EI competencies and work success.

Using the competency framework, Dulewicz and Higgs (2000) studied 100 managers over a 7-year period by looking at a variety of their competencies and at their climb in their organizations. They also measured IQ, EI and potentially related personality traits using paper-and-pencil tests, and competencies that might not exactly match a definition of EI. They used factor analysis and found six factors with Cronbach Alphas above 0.50. They found that competency-based EI factors contributed 0.36 to predicting organizational advancement, vs. IQ contributing 0.27. Combined, they predicted 0.52 of advancement. A third set of factors they called Managerial Quotient (MQ) contributed 0.16 independently and, in combination, raised the EI+IQ+MQ contribution to predicting organizational advancement to 0.71. Thus, although EI contributes more to advancement than traditional IQ, together they predict organizational advancement considerably better than either predicts alone. Dulewicz and Higgs (2000) also found that the paper-and-pencil tests of EI and related personality traits did not do an adequate job of predicting organizational advancement even though their measures correlated well with the competency-based measures of EI.

Although we do not believe that advancement in an organization is a good sole measure of success in life or at work, based on the above it seems safe to conclude that there is likely to be a relationship between EI and success at work. It also seems that it is possible that EI has impacts on work success more than IQ or rational thinking capability, although the two in combination are likely even more important than either factor alone.

Modeling the impact: components and mechanisms of EI that have such impact

The next issue is to model the impact of EI on work success. One way to model EI and its impact would be to use Goleman's (1998) list of EI competencies and to organize them into a matrix that helps us understand how they can have impacts at work (see Table I).

We can see from this matrix that EI competencies are of two types, awareness and skills, and that they are of two levels: personal and social. This way of organizing the competencies helps us to understand that EI helps us to be more competent at our own work as well as in our relationships with others, especially in working more productively with others and influencing others to work more productively with us.

For example, greater levels of self-confidence lead to higher productivity (Bandura, 1977). People who are self-managing (Bandura, 1976) and conscientious (Barrick and Mount, 1991) tend to be more productive. In terms of social competence, a greater service orientation is good for working with customers (in and out of the organization; Greenleaf, 1977), and greater organizational awareness should clearly help people work more effectively in their organization. Better social skills and skills in leadership, influence, communication, conflict management, teamwork, and collaboration are all touted as desirable skills, especially for managers (Jones *et al.*, 2000). Thus, we can see that the traits of someone with high emotional intelligence are

Table I.
EI competencies

	Awareness	Skills
Personal competence (how we manage ourselves)	Self-awareness Emotional self-awareness Accurate self-assessment Self-confidence	Self-management Adaptability Self-control Conscientiousness Initiative Achievement Trustworthiness
Social competence (how we handle relationships)	Social awareness Empathy Service orientation Organizational awareness	Social skills Leadership Influence Developing others Change catalyst Communication Conflict management Building bonds Teamwork and collaboration

conducive to higher productivity and can give us an understanding of the components and mechanisms of EI that can lead to higher productivity or greater success at work.

Review of spirituality findings

The review of findings of the relationship of spirituality with work success will be divided into four parts. The first will attempt to define spirituality. The second will demonstrate that spirituality has impacts on work success. The third will delineate arguments for capturing spirituality in terms of "spiritual intelligence" (SI) to parallel EI. The fourth part will model the impact that spirituality has on work success.

Defining spirituality

There are a number of streams of literature about spirituality. Although books on spirituality in business have become quite popular during the past decade, it is even more difficult to find a common definition for spirituality than for EI. Authors have used the terms "spirituality", "spiritual", and "spirit" in quite disparate ways. One way of categorizing all of the various uses and definitions can be as follows:

- The "spirit" of a culture, organization, or work group, as in "this group is spirited" or as in "the spirit of this organization is strong" (or exciting, open, or any adjective). The "Microsoft Word 97" thesaurus equates spirit with an individual's (or organization's) vitality, mood, nature, or intent.
- "Spiritual" is used similarly, or in ways related to "emotional", or to particular behaviors or attitudes of an individual. For example, being spiritual has been equated with being open, giving, compassionate, or

what we imagine as “holy” in one’s behavior, and usually with being more unflappable and buoyant than others. Many of the types of awareness and some of the skills delineated above in the components of EI have also been attributed to spiritual people.

- Spirituality can also be focused on the origin of being spiritual rather than on the results or signs of it. In this case spirituality has to do with personal experience of God, Allah, the Transcendent, the Beyond, the Sacred. The focus is on the direct experience of something other than what is normally the focus of daily, material, sensory, or even emotional reality. On the other hand, many of the results in daily living of having such experience appear to be similar to the results (behaviors, feeling states, etc.) of being more emotionally mature or intelligent.

For the purpose of this paper, we wish to focus mainly on, and contrast, the second and third definitions. Defining “spiritual” similarly to or in ways related to “emotional”, or to particular behaviors or attitudes of an individual, illustrates that spirituality, for some, is related to emotional states, but raises the issue of whether spirituality separates clearly from the areas of concern in EI.

On the other hand, one can posit that spirituality is and stems from a personal (intra-personal, interior) experience as described above. However, being an intra-personal experience, one cannot empirically test the spiritual experience itself. It is possible that we might find some chemical or physiological markers for such experience in the future, or some behaviors that indicate spiritual depth (as opposed to emotional intelligence, even if some of these behaviors are the same), but so far all we have found are (behavioral, attitudinal, physiological, etc.) correlates for those who report their own spiritual experience or for those who practice practices which are supposed to lead to increased spiritual experiences. Thus, with either definition of spirituality, we will have measurement or theoretical difficulties.

Previous research on spirituality and work

It seems that there are several “camps” of academics in terms of opinions about researching spiritual experiences. One camp will only recognize the kinds of rigorous empirical research that are done on material phenomena, even though, as we have seen, some consider spirituality to be an internal experience of the non-material. A second camp wants to simply accept that these experiences and their reported benefits are real because so many people with these experiences seem to historically report approximately the same experiences, even though they are often not well articulated or specified. A third camp tries to do rigorous correlational work with self-reported experiencers (as above), believing that this is the best one can do. Several recent dissertations have used qualitative research approaches. The stance one takes seems to be a paradigmatic issue (Kuhn, 1970), not an issue that is amenable to scientific investigation at this time (not an issue of “Truth”). We will now examine the

research that has been reported to date, with an emphasis on research involving the impact of spirituality on work behaviors and success.

Charles Tart, the expert on altered states of consciousness (Tart, 1990) (of which he considers spiritual experience to be one type) has a web site at which he encourages those who have had spiritual experiences to share their experiences in detail. Tart proposes that if we can gather enough detailed self-report data about such experiences, we might be able to make objective what begins as a purely subjective experience and reporting mechanism. Until recently, however, most research on spiritual experiences has been based on people with similar self-reported experiences or who have been practicing a similar "spiritual" technique.

Tart (2001) reports that there are now more than 2,000 studies of the effects of spiritual practices or experiences. Spiritual practices that have been reported on or studied include prayer, a variety of Eastern energy practices such as tai chi, chi gong, martial arts, and yoga, and a variety of Eastern and Western breathing and meditation practices. The many medical research reviews of spiritual practices have demonstrated that spiritual practices produce many positive physiological and psychological health benefits. For example, spiritual well-being has been purported to provide a significant inner strength to people, especially in times of uncertainty and chaos in life. Also, some health insurance companies have lowered their premiums for groups whose participants regularly practice one of these techniques.

The largest single group of studies of spirituality – more than 600 studies – is based on people who practice the Transcendental Meditation™ technique (Wallace *et al.*, 1976-1990; Maharishi University of Management, 2001). These studies have examined physiological, psychological, and behavioral changes of people who have practiced Transcendental Meditation™. We will now briefly summarize the results of these studies.

In terms of physiological changes, those who practice Transcendental Meditation™ (and report increasing spiritual experiences) are found to consistently have changed patterns of brain waves (more coherent; Gaylord *et al.*, 1989), increased blood flow to the brain (Jevning and Wilson, 1978), decreased stress hormone production (Hill, 1989), increased muscle relaxation, and lower baseline levels of heart rate, respiration rate, and skin resistance (all "good" things; Dillbeck and Orme-Johnson, 1987). These have been empirically found to lead to increased efficiency of information transfer in the brain (Warshall, 1980), faster recovery from stress, faster physical reactions, and increased stability of the autonomic nervous system (Orme-Johnson, 1973).

Long term practice of Transcendental Meditation™ has also been correlated with enhanced creativity and intelligence (Jedrczak *et al.*, 1985), increased field independence (Fergusson, 1993), improved functioning of both the left and right hemispheres of the brain (verbal and analytical thinking as well as synthetic and holistic thinking), and accelerated cognitive development in children (Warner, 1986). In education it has been correlated with increased IQ and academic performance in secondary, college, and graduate students

(Muehlman *et al.*, 1988; Cranson *et al.*, 1991; Kember, 1985), improved problem solving ability, increased creativity, increased innovation, autonomy, and independence, increased self-esteem, increased ability to deal with abstract and complex situations, and decreased anxiety (Shecter, 1977).

Definitions,
models and ideas
for research

Psychologically, Transcendental Meditation™ has been found to lead to increased self-actualization (Alexander *et al.*, 1991), general psychological health (Gelderloos *et al.*, 1990), stronger self-identity (Turnbull and Norris, 1982), improved perception of others (Holeman and Seiler, 1979), greater empathy (Griggs, 1976), orientation towards positive values (Gelderloos *et al.*, 1987), growth of wisdom (ego development, affective functioning, and cognitive development; Chandler, 1990), less neuroticism, depression, and sensitivity to criticism, and increased self-esteem, ego strength, and self-actualization (Van Den Berg and Mulder, 1976), increased time competence, independence, self-supportiveness, self-acceptance, sensitivity to one's own needs and feelings, and capacity for warm interpersonal relationships (Nidich *et al.*, 1973), greater interest in academic activities, intellectual orientation, adaptability of mental orientation, social extroversion, personal integration, and altruism, and less impulsiveness and anxiety (Penner *et al.*, 1974), and more positive social psychological attitudes (Hanley and Spates, 1978).

In business, practicing Transcendental Meditation™ has been correlated with improved work performance, improved relations with co-workers and supervisors, increased work satisfaction, and decreased turnover propensity (Frew, 1974; Alexander *et al.*, 1993).

Tart (1990) and his colleagues have done extensive work over the past four decades that demonstrates that having altered states of consciousness, especially states in which one experiences the spiritual realm (Tart calls this cosmic consciousness), has a profound and sometimes lasting impact on one's view of life, way of feeling about others and life, etc. Tart and his collaborators, and others, have found many physiological, psychological, and behavioral correlates for many of the other practices mentioned above that are somewhat similar to the correlates for Transcendental Meditation™.

A number of dissertations on spirituality and work have appeared in the past ten years. Three of these studies involved correlating some measure of spirituality with a measure of work performance. Zwart (2000) correlated the scores of 266 leaders on the Spirituality Assessment Scale by Hamilton Beazley with the Multifactor Leadership Questionnaire by Bass and Avolio, and found no relationship between spirituality and transformational leadership. Frew (2000) correlated indices of organizational stressors, strain and spirituality of 141 employees in a public health organization, finding a significant main effect for spirituality and strain. Trott (1996) correlated a spiritual well-being scale, general self-efficacy scale, organizational commitment scale, open organization profile and an interview schedule for 184 workers in a fortune 100 engineering-construction organization. In addition to using correlational measures, Frew and Trott also used qualitative analyses. Frew used qualitative data obtained

from interviews of a sub-sample of 28 employees, and Trott analyzed 20 interview transcripts using theory elaboration procedures.

Much of the empirical research relating spirituality to work in the past ten years has been in the form of dissertations, and most of those dissertations have used some type of qualitative analysis. For example, Foley (1999) used an "appreciative inquiry", creating a "consensual document" based on the stories consultants reported "when they felt their spirituality alive in their work." Kurth (1995) conducted a "phenomenological study of selfless service" compiled from in depth interviews of 20 participants. Parish and Buller (1999) conducted a qualitative case study to examine whether spirituality inspired effective styles of six educational leaders, three ministerial practitioners, and three political electees. Jacobsen (1994) conducted a delphi study of an international panel of nine experts to explore the relationship between spirituality and transformational leadership. In addition, a number of doctoral dissertations are currently underway using approaches including photographs, diaries and journals, and mixed media.

There is much evidence in the emerging body of literature that human beings at work have spiritual needs, many times unfulfilled. However, profit centered business organizations have, for the most part, failed to recognize the merit of spiritual well-being at work. Organizations have for the most part left this dimension of life up to the individual worker. Egan (1999) believes that one of the reasons why organizations have avoided the issue of spirituality in the workplace is that it is often associated with negative connotations of proselyte, the evangelical right, or unduly influence of subordinate behavior. To avoid these issues, he substitutes the word good for spiritual, and claims that the characteristics of a "good and effective" (i.e. spiritual) manager are: trust, competence: grow your subordinates, teach and reward teamwork, be able to negotiate win/win outcomes; focus on delivering quality and value to customers.

McCormick (1994) claims that, in spite of recent studies showing that most Americans believe in a God or Universal Spirit (and we must assume this includes many managers as well), the academic literature is void of much research in this area. McCormick cites a number of studies that offer evidence that believing managers claim their relationship with God influences their work more than any other variable. McCormick (1994) cites themes that emerged from the literature on spirituality and the workplace:

- compassion;
- right livelihood;
- selfless service;
- meditative work; and
- the problem of pluralism.

The research so far has gathered evidence of relationships between experiences or practices and "resultant" behaviors. Some of the studies (e.g. see above)

present causal evidence: that spiritual practices or experiences seem to lead to certain behaviors, attitudes, or personality traits. The experiences are either self-reported (e.g. questionnaires, interviews) or are investigated using physiological or other proxies for the experiences, or they use practices that have been shown to develop spiritual experiences. The behaviors, attitudes, personality traits, work characteristics, etc. studied as the dependent variables have been quite varied, as can be seen above. Moreover, subjects have been reported on directly, or they have been compared to themselves over time (with practices), to others who have been using practices for different periods of time, or to control groups that either did nothing or used other techniques, or reported not having spiritual experiences. Studies have been qualitative and quantitative.

This wide variety of research seems to indicate that there are benefits to either practicing a spiritual technique or having a spiritual experience (or both).

A case for spiritual intelligence?

In the past two years, two writers (Emmons, 2000; Zohar and Marshall, 2001) have postulated the notion that spirituality could be an intelligence. Interestingly, this idea was also a focus of attention in the 1920s (Laird, 1925; Moss *et al.*, 1927). We will now examine each recent writer's arguments.

Emmons (2000), writing in the discipline of psychology of religion, argues that spirituality meets Gardner's (1993) criteria for an intelligence and should be included as an intelligence. (Gardner wrote specifically that spirituality is not an intelligence.) In doing so Emmons (2000, p. 10) postulates that there are at least five core abilities that define spiritual intelligence – namely:

- (a) the capacity for transcendence; (b) the ability to enter into heightened spiritual states of consciousness; (c) the ability to invest everyday activities, events, and relationships with a sense of the sacred; (d) the ability to utilize spiritual resources to solve problems in living; and (e) the capacity to engage in virtuous behaviors or to be virtuous (to show forgiveness; to express gratitude; to be humble; to display compassion).

Zohar and Marshall (2001) propose that in addition to IQ and EQ (EI), there is another type of intelligence they call "SQ" or "spiritual intelligence". Further, they propose that IQ and EQ are subsidiary to and supported by SQ; SQ is the highest intelligence. Their book has not received the best reviews.

So far these seem to be the only arguments for "spiritual intelligence". At this point it seems unclear whether spirituality can be classified as a form or type of intelligence, and for this paper's purposes it might not need to be.

Modeling the impact: components and mechanisms of spirituality that have such impact

Although there is no model that breaks spirituality into its components, the research about spirituality can give us clues about some of the aspects of or results of spirituality. We will try to categorize these components into the same general categories as we used to categorize EI components (see Table II for a visual representation of these categories).

Table II.
Competencies that
result from increased
spirituality

	Awareness	Skills
Personal competence (how we manage ourselves)	Self-awareness Emotional self-awareness Positive self-assessment Self-esteem Independence, self-supportiveness Time competence Self-actualization	Independence Adaptability/flexibility Less impulsiveness, neuroticism Work performance
Social competence (how we handle relationships)	Positive social attitudes Empathy Altruism	Good relations with co-workers Good relations with supervisors Social extroversion Collaborative, developmental Orientation towards positive values Less sensitivity to criticism

The factors noted in Table II derive from the research on the effects of spirituality cited above. For example, in terms of personal awareness competencies, self-awareness, emotional self-awareness, positive self-assessment, and self-esteem all increase with spirituality. These are similar to the personal awareness competencies for EI. In addition, spirituality seems to bring a sense of independence, self-supportiveness, time competence, and self-actualization. Also, some of these traits are, or lead to, personal or social skills. For example, time competence not only is a different kind of awareness of time, but also can lead to different behaviors related to prioritizing time-related activities and getting things done. Self-actualizing and high self-esteem people tend to behave quite differently from other people, especially towards other people. High self-acceptance (positive self-assessment) people tend to lead others in ways that focus on their development and build bonds rather than by barking orders, and tend to be more collaborative than others. Independent people are more self-managing. We can see, then, that those who grow in spirituality tend to grow in both personal and social level EI skills. On the social awareness side, spiritual people demonstrate more positive social attitudes, more empathy, and greater altruism – parallel to EI. They also tend to feel more satisfied with their work. In addition to the social skills mentioned in the last paragraph, those with higher spirituality demonstrate more positive social psychological attitudes, greater social extroversion, greater adaptability of mental orientation (adapt more easily to changes), improved relationships with co-workers and supervisors, greater orientation towards positive values, and less neuroticism, anxiety, and sensitivity to criticism.

From the above, we can see that there are great parallels between the awareness and skill competencies of EI and the behavioral, attitude, and personality results of spirituality. However, as Emmons (2000, p. 9) mentioned, we want to caution against making an erroneous inferential leap from the above list of effects of spirituality to defining spirituality in those terms.

Spirituality is more than the qualities of the above list; these are just some of the behavioral and emotional results of being more spiritual.

Definitions,
models and ideas
for research

213

The developmental perspective on EI and spirituality

It is widely held that IQ does not change in adulthood, and, except for several studies on Transcendental MeditationTM (e.g. Cranson *et al.*, 1991; Jedrczak *et al.*, 1985), we have not seen any evidence of processes that systematically raise adult IQ. On the other hand, Goleman (1996) clearly argues that EI can be taught or trained – increased in adulthood. This is the underlying theme and purpose of his books and articles: we can improve our success in life by improving our EI. Dulewicz and Higgs (2000) reviewed all of the EI work and concluded that most researchers in this area do not believe that EI can be raised in adults. This prevailing view is similar to the prevailing view that changing the basic pattern of an individual's personality in adulthood is rare and entails a very long-term process. On the other hand, we have seen above that techniques such as Transcendental MeditationTM could have the power to raise IQ and improve many other mental functions, and to improve many personality and EI-type traits.

From a business viewpoint, there are two key issues. The first is that there is a causal link between these traits and work success (productivity, etc.). The second is that these traits can be developed (improved) in people, leading to improved success at work. We have already shown that IQ, EI, and spirituality improve work success. The next step is to find ways to improve any of these so that work success is improved. This is a major area for investigation.

Future research

There are several other potential areas of study that arise from the above. Regarding the development of the EI traits, we might suggest that one starting point could be research using the databases of the large leadership training centers. Many executives go to these centers more than once over time, and are often given similar tests each time they go. They also usually answer demographic questions at these facilities, including about their work success. It might be helpful to use this test, demographic, and success data across such training centers to study changes over time in these leaders who attempt to improve themselves.

Other opportunities to study means to the development (enhancement) of work success include studying the various spiritual techniques over time to see what changes or improvements occur at work as a result of the practices. We would also call for further studies of EI traits directly in relation to work behaviors and success.

We would suggest broadening the dependent variable, “success”, to other kinds of individual success at work rather than just climbing the corporate ladder. Derr (1986) made a clear, empirical case that the majority of workers,

including professionals, are not primarily oriented in their career to climbing the corporate ladder.

Although we have treated EI and spirituality as separate areas, as they likely are, they appear to lead to similar attitudes, behaviors, and skills. Also, many of these attitudes, behaviors, and skills seem to lead to life and work success. Further, many articles about spirituality tend to focus on or include emotional components so that there often seems to be confusion, or at least intersection and linking, between the two constructs (e.g. Egan, 1999). Thus, it might be useful to develop an overall understanding of the relationships among these factors. Figure 1 offers five ways to possibly model these relationships. We would encourage investigation of these models to see if one has greater explanatory success than the others for either linking or de-coupling these two constructs.

It might also be helpful to investigate exactly which attitudes, behaviors, or skills lead to greater success. It is possible that there is a subset of these that

Model	Explanation
EI → Performance SI → Performance	Completely independent causal models
EI → Performance SI → Performance	Linked causal model
EI → Performance ↓ EI/SI → Performance ↑ SI → Performance	Linked causal model with specified common elements
EI → SI → Performance SI → EI → Performance ? → EI or SI → Performance EI or SI → ? → Performance	Either a moderator or a mediator (intervening) variable causal model. Four possible options shown here.
EI ↓ EI/SI → Performance ↑ SI	Only specified common elements are causes

Figure 1.
Possible explanatory
models

have more causal value than the others. It is also possible that for some people certain of these elements are more important than for others, leading to a broader list of elements that are causal to success. Studying these competing models will require a combination of research methodologies – both quantitative and qualitative.

Definitions,
models and ideas
for research

Conclusion

In reviewing prior research on emotional intelligence and on spirituality, this paper has established that both EI and spirituality seem to lead to greater individual work success and that the effect size is important enough to investigate further. Anything that leads to a substantive amount of greater work success is worth further investigation.

This paper presented two figures that attempt to capture the essential components or elements of enhanced EI and of enhanced spirituality that might have a positive impact on work success at the individual level. It presented research that demonstrates the relationship between each element and some aspect of work success. It found great similarities among these elements for EI and spirituality. In addition, the figures are structured to help us better understand the elements and their relationship to enhanced work performance. They organized the elements into four types of competency enhancements: personal awareness, personal skills, social awareness, and social skills. By grouping the elements, future research might be more broadly focused and effective.

Some of the literature links or combines EI with spirituality, while some separates these two concepts. In either case, they seem to lead to many similar behaviors, attitudes, and skills (competencies), which in turn lead to greater work success. The amount of linkage between EI and spirituality is worth investigating, and this paper presented several models that might help to focus and organize that investigation.

The practical reason that understanding the linkage or lack of linkage can be important is that it can help when we attempt to develop people for their enhanced success. EI and spirituality seem to aim at the development of similar competencies, but quite differently. Investigating these linkages can help us to answer: Might there be several distinct developmental paths? If so, could there be some common elements across developmental paths?

This paper found that although it is still unclear whether developing EI is possible, it is clear that developing people's spirituality is possible. Many studies have shown the positive results of developing spirituality. By juxtaposing EI and spirituality in this paper, a broader view has emerged: there are a number of competencies that can lead to enhanced individual work success, and they can be developed. Future research can lead to the discovery of the most practical, effective, and efficient methods of developing these competencies.

References

- Alexander, C.N., Rainforth, M.V. and Gelderloos, P. (1991), "Transcendental Meditation, self-actualization, and psychological health: a conceptual overview and statistical meta-analysis", *Journal of Social Behavior and Personality*, Vol. 6 No. 5, pp. 189-247.
- Alexander, C.N., Swanson, G.C., Rainforth, M.V., Carlisle, T.W., Todd, C.C. and Oates, R.M. (1993), "Effects of the Transcendental Meditation program on stress reduction, health, and employee development: A prospective study in two occupational settings", *Anxiety, Stress and Coping: An International Journal*, Vol. 6, pp. 245-62.
- Bandura, A. (1976), "Self-reinforcement: theoretical and methodological considerations", *Behaviorism*, Vol. 4, pp. 135-55.
- Bandura, A. (1977), *Social Learning Theory*, Prentice-Hall, Englewood Cliffs, NJ.
- Barrick, M.R. and Mount, M.K. (1991), "The big five personality dimensions and job performance: a meta-analysis", *Personnel Psychology*, Vol. 44, pp. 1-26.
- Chandler, H.M. (1990), "Transcendental meditation and awakening wisdom: a 10-year longitudinal study of self-development (meditation)", *Dissertation Abstracts International*, Vol. 51 No. 10, pp. 5048B.
- Cranson, R.W., Orme-Johnson, D.W., Gackenbach J., Dillbeck, M.C., Jones, C.H. and Alexander, C.N. (1991), "Transcendental Meditation and improved performance on intelligence-related measures: a longitudinal study", *Personality and Individual Differences*, Vol. 12 No. 10, pp. 1105-16.
- Derr, C.B. (1986), *Managing the New Careerists: The Diverse Career Success Orientations of Today's Workers*, Jossey-Bass, San Francisco, CA.
- Dillbeck, M.C. and Orme-Johnson, D.W. (1987), "Physiological differences between Transcendental Meditation and rest", *American Psychologist*, Vol. 42, pp. 879-81.
- Dulewicz and Higgs, M. (2000), *Emotional Intelligence, A Review and Evaluation Study*, Henley Management College, Henley-on-Thames.
- Egan, T. (1999), "Defining spirituality in the workplace", *Spirit at Work Newsletter*, <http://www.fourgateways.com/newsletr/art004.htm>.
- Emmons, R.A. (2000), "Is spirituality an intelligence? Motivation, cognition, and the psychology of ultimate concern", *The International Journal for the Psychology of Religion*, Vol. 10 No. 1, pp. 3-26.
- Fergusson, L.C. (1993), "Field independence, Transcendental Meditation and achievement in college art: a reexamination", *Perceptual and Motor Skills*, Vol. 77, pp. 1104-6.
- Foley, A.M. (1999), *Spirituality in Work: Stories of Organizational Consultants*, Dissertation Abstracts International, California Institute of Integral Studies, San Francisco, CA.
- Frew, D.R. (1974), "Transcendental Meditation and productivity", *Academy of Management Journal*, Vol. 17, pp. 362-8.
- Frew, E.J. (2000), "Stressors, strain and spirituality at work", *Dissertation Abstracts International*, New Mexico State University, Las Cruces, NM.
- Gardner, H. (1993), *Multiple Intelligences, the Theory in Practice*, Basic Books, New York, NY.
- Gaylord, C., Orme-Johnson, D.W. and Travis, F. (1989), "The effects of the Transcendental Meditation technique and progressive muscle relaxation on EEG coherence, stress reactivity, and mental health in black adults", *International Journal of Neuroscience*, Vol. 46, pp. 77-86.
- Gelderloos, P., Goddard, P.H. III, Ahlstrom, H.H.B. and Jacoby, R. (1987), "Cognitive orientation toward positive values in advanced participants of the TM and TM-Sidhi program", *Perceptual and Motor Skills*, Vol. 64, pp. 1003-12.

- Gelderloos, P., Hermans, H.J.M., Ahlstrom, H.H. and Jacoby, R. (1990), "Transcendence and psychological health: studies with long-term participants of the Transcendental Meditation and TM-Sidhi program", *Journal of Psychology*, Vol. 124 No. 2, pp. 177-97.
- Goleman, D. (1996), *Emotional Intelligence: Why It Can Matter More Than IQ*, Bloomsbury Publishing, London.
- Goleman, D. (1998), *Working with the Emotional Intelligence*, Bantam Books, New York, NY.
- Greenleaf, R.K. (1977), *Servant Leadership: A Journey into the Nature of Legitimate Power and Greatness*, Paulist Press, New York, NY.
- Griggs, S.T. (1976), "A preliminary study into the effect of Transcendental Meditation on empathy", Master's thesis (abbr.), School of Human Behavior, United States International University, San Diego, CA.
- Hanley, C.P. and Spates, J.L. (1978), "Transcendental Meditation and social psychological attitudes", *The Journal of Psychology*, Vol. 99, pp. 121-7.
- Hill, D.A. (1989), "Beta-adrenergic receptor sensitivity, autonomic balance and serotonergic activity in practitioners of Transcendental Meditation", Doctoral dissertation, Maharishi University of Management, USA *Dissertation Abstracts International*, Vol. 50 No. 8, pp. 3330-B.
- Holeman, R. and Seiler, G. (1979), "Effects of sensitivity training and Transcendental Meditation on perception of others", *Perceptual and Motor Skills*, Vol. 49, p. 270.
- Jacobsen, S.E. (1994), "Spirituality and transformational leadership in secular settings: a Delphi study", *Dissertation Abstracts International*, Seattle University, WA.
- Jedrczak, A., Beresford, M. and Clements, G. (1985), "The TM-Sidhi program, pure consciousness, creativity and intelligence", *The Journal of Creative Behavior*, Vol. 19 No. 4, pp. 270-5.
- Jevning, R. and Wilson, A.F. (1978), "Behavioral increase of cerebral blood flow", *The Physiologist*, Vol. 21, p. 60 (Abstract).
- Jones, G.R., George, J.M. and Hill, C.W.L. (2000), *Contemporary Management*, Irwin McGraw-Hill, Boston, MA.
- Kember, P. (1985), "The Transcendental Meditation technique and postgraduate academic performance", *British Journal of Educational Psychology*, Vol. 55, pp. 164-6.
- Kuhn, T.S. (1970), *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions*, University of Chicago Press, Chicago, IL.
- Kurth, K.E. (1995), "An exploration of the expression and perceived impact of selfless service in for-profit organizations (spirituality)", *Dissertation Abstracts International*, The George Washington, Washington, DC.
- Laird, D.A. (1925), *The Psychology of Selecting Men* (2nd ed.), McGraw-Hill, New York, NY.
- McCormick, D.W. (1994), "Spirituality and management", *Journal of Management Psychology*, Vol. 9 No. 6, pp. 5-8.
- Maharishi University of Management (2001), available: http://www.mum.edu/tm_research/tm_biblio/welcome.html
- Martinez, M.N. (1997), "The smarts that count", *HR Magazine*, Vol. 42 No. 11, pp. 72-8.
- Moss, F.A., Hunt, T., Omwake, K.T. and Bonning, M.M. (1927), *Social Intelligence Test*, Center for Psychological Service, Washington, DC.
- Muehlman, J.M., Nidich, S.I., Reilly, B. and Cole, C. (1988), "Relationship of the practice of the Transcendental Meditation technique to academic achievement", paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Mid-Western Educational Research Association, Chicago, IL, October, (Refer also to Abstracts of Papers of the Annual Meeting of the Mid-Western Educational Research Association, p. 6, 1988.)

- Nidich, S., Seeman, W. and Dreskin, T. (1973), "Influence of Transcendental Meditation on self-actualization: a replication", *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, Vol. 20, pp. 565-6.
- Orme-Johnson, D.W. (1973), "Autonomic stability and Transcendental Meditation", *Psychosomatic Medicine*, Vol. 35, pp. 341-9.
- Parish, J. and Buller, C. (1999), "Women in education: Effective leadership styles as inspired by spirituality", *Dissertation Abstracts International*, University of La Verne, CA.
- Penner, W.J., Zingle, H.W., Dyck, R. and Truch, S. (1974), "Does an in-depth Transcendental Meditation course effect change in the personalities of the participants?", *Western Psychologist*, Vol. 4, pp. 104-11.
- Salovey, P. and Mayer, J.D. (1990), "Emotional intelligence", *Imagination, Cognition and Personality*, Vol. 9, pp. 185-211.
- Shecter, H. (1977), "The Transcendental Meditation program in the classroom: A psychological evaluation", Doctoral thesis (summary), Graduate Department of Psychology, York University, North York, Ontario, *Dissertation Abstracts International*, Vol. 38 No. 7, p. 3372B.
- Tart, C.T. (Ed.) (1990), *Altered States of Consciousness: A Book of Readings*, Harper Collins, New York, NY.
- Tart, C.T. (2001), Personal communications with Len Tischler.
- Trott, D.C. III (1996), "Spiritual well being of workers: An exploratory study of spirituality in the workplace", *Dissertation Abstracts International*, The University of Texas at Austin; 0227.
- Turnbull, M.J. and Norris, H. (1982), "Effects of Transcendental Meditation on self-identity indices and personality", *British Journal of Psychology*, Vol. 73, pp. 57-68.
- Van Den Berg, W.P. and Mulder, B. (1976), "Psychological research on the effects of the Transcendental Meditation technique on a number of personality variables", *Gedrag: Tijdschrift voor Psychologie (Behavior: Journal of Psychology)*, Vol. 4, pp. 206-18.
- Wallace, R.K., Orme-Johnson, D. and Dillbeck, M. (Eds) (1976-1990), *Scientific Research on Maharishi's Transcendental Meditation and TM-Sidhi Program, Collected Papers*, Volumes 1-5, Maharishi International University Press, Fairfield, IA (Volume 6 in press).
- Warner, T.Q. (1986), "Transcendental Meditation and developmental advancement: mediating abilities and conservation performance", *Dissertation Abstracts International*, Vol. 47 No. 8, pp. 3558B.
- Warshall, D. (1980), "Effects of the Transcendental Meditation technique on normal and Jendrassik reflex time", *Perceptual and Motor Skills*, Vol. 50, pp. 1103-6.
- Zohar, D. and Marshall, I. (2001), *SQ: Connecting with Our Spiritual Intelligence*, Bloomsbury Publishing, New York, NY.
- Zwart, G.A. (2000), "The relationship between spirituality and transformational leadership in public, private and nonprofit sector organizations", *Dissertation Abstracts International*, University of La Verne, CA.